**College:** McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts  
**Syllabus:** HCE-655, **GLOBAL BIOETHICS**, Fall 2016  
**Course:** Tuesday 3:05-5:45 pm., Fisher Hall [location tbd]  
**Office hours:** Appointment, Fisher Hall 300;  
Tel. (412) 396-4504  
Email: tenhavelh@duq.edu  
**Course instructor:** Henk ten Have, M.D., Ph.D.  
Director and Professor, Center for Healthcare Ethics  
Duquesne University, 600 Forbes Avenue, Pittsburgh, PA 15282

**OUTLINE**

One of the new and exciting features of present-day healthcare ethics is that it is increasingly incorporated in an ethical discourse that is globally orientated. Mainstream bioethics with the famous four principles is therefore included in the broader discourse of global bioethics.

This course will study the concept as well as contents of global bioethics. As an international enterprise, global bioethics is closely connected to international human rights law. International organizations such as UNESCO (the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, headquartered in Paris) and WHO (the World Health Organization, headquartered in Geneva) are active in the field of global bioethics, particularly in relation to developing countries. Fundamental bioethical principles have been determined which are shared among all nations and that form a global framework for the analysis of ethical issues around the globe. Global challenges such as pandemics, organ trade, health tourism, human trafficking, lack of access to medication, commercial surrogate motherhood, and bioterrorism require cooperation and solidarity among countries and different actors.

This course will demand to identify and analyze a selected global challenge so that you will be able to explain what global bioethics is and why it is necessary. Extensive attention will be paid to the global ethical framework, including principles such as human dignity, respect for cultural diversity, solidarity, sharing of benefits, and protection of future generations. Finally, the course will demonstrate how to apply global bioethics in policies and practices to address global challenges in diverging contexts and countries, for example in other religious traditions, in low-income countries, and in international cooperation and exchange.

**COURSE OBJECTIVES**

a) **Course description.** The course will make students familiar with the recent issues and debates in global bioethics. It will explain basic notions of global bioethics, as
identified in the *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*, unanimously adopted by the 193 Members States of UNESCO in 2005. The focus will be on universal principles such as human dignity and human rights, respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity, respect for cultural diversity and pluralism, solidarity and cooperation, social responsibility and health, sharing of benefits, protecting future generations, and protection of the environment, the biosphere and biodiversity. The course will also study the applications of the fundamental principles in various settings around the world.

b) **Research competencies.** Upon completion of the course students should master the following competencies, as should be demonstrated both in specific research projects and presentations, and in the research essay:
   a. Identification and explanation of global bioethical challenges, exemplified in a case study;
   b. Systematic analysis of global bioethical challenges with fundamental ethical principles of global bioethics;
   c. Formulation and examination of practices and policies to address global bioethical challenges.

c) **General HCE Program Learning Outcomes.** All of these Learning Outcomes pertain to HCE-655.
   a. **Fundamental Knowledge.**
      Students can understand and analyze HCE theory and methods as well as major applied topics in a global context.
   b. **Multi-disciplinary Study.**
      Students can critically relate HCE with multi-disciplinary fields in health care as a diverse and global enterprise (empirical research, law, medicine, philosophy, religion, science, etc).
   c. **Scholarship**
      Students can research and write scholarly essays, teach and communicate effectively, and present academic papers that:
      - present cogent arguments,
      - engage scholarly literature, and
      - demonstrate critical thinking and analysis.
   d. **Professionalism**
      Students can integrate academic learning with experiential learning in clinical/organizational rotations as a function of service-learning and development as an HCE professional.
   e. **Ethical Leadership**
      Students can function as HCE expert and provide ethical leadership, with the knowledge, skills, competencies and character traits to provide ethics services (ethics consultations, ethics committees, institutional review boards, etc.).
   f. **Co-Curricular Practices for Life-long Learning**
      Students can foster co-curricular practices for life-long learning to personally value and engage the clinical, organizational, and professional
components of HCE in a global context. Practice include: accessing journals and literature for developments in HCE; networking with colleagues in professional associations; fostering a community of scholars in the HCE program, for example, participating in seminars/colloquia/speaker events, preparing for comprehensive exams, writing doctoral projects.

**COURSE PROCEDURES.**

**a) Course components**

The Fall semester will be divided into four learning components:

i. Research Project #1 (case study), week 1-4; due Friday September 16 for Seminar #2, September 20.

ii. Research Project #2 (8 pages), week 5-8; due Friday October 14 for Seminar #3, October 18.

iii. Research Project #3 (8 pages), week 9-11; due Friday November 4 for Seminar #4, November 8.

   2. Option to submit mid-term essay. For students who want to be assisted in their progress, a draft of the essay can be submitted for feedback; by Friday October 18.
   3. Submit Research Essay by Friday December 9, 5:00 pm.

**b) Research projects**

1. **Different type of Research projects.** Projects can be different: presentations, mini-teaching exercise, short papers.

2. **Feedback.** Completed materials for a research project should be submitted in advance of a Research Seminar. Students will receive feedback on the materials before the Seminars will begin.

3. **Reading Requirements.** Each Research Project will require students to critically engage the equivalent of 3 books to (a) master the relevant knowledge and (b) engage in critical reading and writing.

4. **Research competencies.** The research competencies in the course are identified by the three Research Projects: (a) case analysis, (b) systematic examination of fundamental ethical principles, and (c) formulation of policies and practices to address the case.

5. **Relation of Projects with Essay.** The three Research Projects may be integrated into the Research (or Course) Essay but not in a manner of cut-and-paste from one to the other. The Research Essay typically demonstrates that the student can apply and integrate all three research
competencies in relation to a specific topic or issue in research ethics. While the research papers are focused on one specific competency, the course essay must demonstrate all three competencies. The course essay furthermore is based on a self-selected thesis different for each student, while the topics of the research papers are given and similar for all students.

c) **Research Seminars.** There will be four seminars introducing each of the three research competencies.

1. **Week 1, Seminar #1**
   - i. Introduction to the course
   - ii. Introduction to the area of global bioethics
   - iii. Discussion of research project requirements and course essay
   - iv. Course essay thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography to be submitted by end of week 4

2. **Week 5, Seminar #2**
   - i. Demonstration of Research Project #1 (video and case)
   - ii. Introduction to Research Project #2
   - iii. Discussion of progress on research essays

3. **Week 9, Seminar #3**
   - i. Discussion of progress on research essays
   - ii. Discussion of completed Research Project #2

4. **Week 12, Seminar #4**
   - i. Discussion of completed Research Project #3
   - ii. Brief presentations (max 8 min) of the course essays

d) **Course essay.** The course research essay will require students to substantively apply the Research Competencies of this course to a particular issue (theoretical or practical). Requirements:

1. Start to reflect on the thesis of your course essay from the beginning of the course.
2. Thesis and 1-page outline with basic bibliography to be submitted by the end of week 4 (September 16) (email to tenhaveh@duq.edu).
3. You will receive feedback in or before Seminar #2.
4. Progress will be reported in the subsequent Seminars.
5. Each student will briefly present the course essay (max. 8 minutes) during the final Seminar and submit a copy of the essay by date assigned.
6. The course essay length should be **25 pages**, double-spacing; font 12 Times New Roman; this concerns the main body of text; title page, table of content, endnotes and bibliography do not count within the 25 pages.
7. Students must adopt the format of the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as required by the College for dissertation submissions.
8. Select an Essay Title that reflects a research thesis. For example the thesis can be:
i. “The ethical principle of respect for human vulnerability is particularly important to protect people in developing countries”,
or
ii. “What are the ethical justifications of the principle of benefit sharing”

The title will then be something like:

a. Human vulnerability and developing countries
b. Ethics and benefit sharing

9. Make a Title page and a separate Table of Content.
10. Present a brief Introduction and Conclusion.
11. Notes to the references made in the essay.
   i. Use end notes (as opposed to foot notes at the bottom of the page).
   ii. Do not use notes for narrative explanations – they belong in the main text.
   iii. There should be approximately 100 end notes in the essay.
12. Bibliography. List all the references in alphabetical order following the last name of the (first) author. Only list items actually referred to in the essay.
13. Divisions and subdivisions. Use major divisions (headings) and subdivisions (subheadings), evenly distributed throughout the essay, to lay out the sequence of concepts and arguments.
14. Use of online references. Online references must be accurately identified with complete web address etc, including the date of access.

**RESEARCH PROJECT 1: GLOBAL BIOETHICS LABORATORY**

For this project you have to identify and elaborate a specific case in global bioethics. Follow the subsequent steps.

**Preparation:**

1. Go to the list of global bioethical problems in the book *Global Bioethics* (page 57) and select a topic from the list (e.g. bioterrorism).
2. Search the internet and find a case of the selected topic (e.g. bioterrorism)
   a. Focus on specified bioethics sources.
   b. The case can be individual or policy focused (e.g. the Baby Gammy case (page 187) or the recent arrest of a scientist in Nairobi, trying to develop anthrax virus with the purpose of attacking a shopping center). The case can also illustrate a general problem, for example care drain (*Global Bioethics*, page 226) but then you have to demonstrate and elaborate this for a specific country. A case therefore refers to a general problem but does it in a concrete and specific manner so that the problem becomes lively and visible.
   c. Criteria for the case:
      i. Occurring in developing country (not Europe, US or Canada)
      ii. Recent (since 2010)
iii. Global impact

3. Find a video to illustrate your case; go to YouTube and other internet sources to identify an illustrative video message concerning your case (news item, special item from NGO etc). The video should not be longer than 5-8 minutes.

4. Describe and explain the main aspects of the case in 400 words:
   a. Basic facts of the case (what happened and why?)
   b. Connection between local and global events (why is the case a problem or a concern for global bioethics?)
   c. Read and use *Global Bioethics* and *Vulnerability* to clarify the global dimension of the case.

**Presentation (Seminar # 2; September 20, 2016):**

1. Bring copies of your case description and distribute them in your class. The case description should have a clear title as well as your name.
2. Make sure that your video is installed and is working well in the classroom.
3. Present your case and video in maximum 10 minutes.
4. Your presentation will be followed by discussion; focus will be on:
   a. What exactly is the global dimension?
   b. Problematic aspects of the case?
   c. Missing data and facts?
   d. Different perspectives?

**Follow-up**

5. One student will be assigned to review the case description and provide suggestions for enhancement. The reviewer will take the following actions:
   a. Review the description and ask yourself: How can the case description be improved and made more informative and comprehensive?
   b. Write your comments (around 500 words) and email them to the author of the case description.
6. The author of the case description uses the review as an incentive to improve and elaborate the case description from 400 into 800 words.
7. The revised case description should be emailed to tenhaveh@duq.edu before Seminar #3 (18 October 2016).

**RESEARCH PROJECT 2: GLOBAL BIOETHICS DEBATE**

For this second research project you will be using the same case as in the first project. The purpose now is to analyze the case with the global bioethics principles of the UNESCO Declaration. You now have to show what makes your case *ethically* problematic.

1. Study the books *Global Bioethics* and *Vulnerability*; make yourself familiar with the ‘horizon’ of global bioethics.
2. Examine the broader ethical framework of global bioethics, and specifically its ethical principles discussed in *The UNESCO Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights. Background, principles and application.*
3. Write a paper of maximum 8 pages (not including the end notes and bibliography), answering the following questions
   a. Explain why your case study is a global ethical problem
   b. What ethical principles in the UDBHR are relevant in your case in order to explain its moral dimensions?
   c. What is the most important ethical principle at stake in your case?
   d. Elaborate how this principle clarifies why the case is problematic.
4. Forward the paper to: tenhaveh@duq.edu on Friday October 14 for Seminar #3, October 18, 2016.
5. Prepare a brief report (5 minutes) on your paper for Seminar #3.

RESEARCH PROJECT 3: GLOBAL BIOETHICAL SOLUTIONS
The third research project focuses on the question what can be done in your case study. How should your case be addressed from an ethical perspective? What practices and policies should be developed to make the case less problematic? Global ethical problems demand action at the global level, but at the same time activities should be undertaken at the local level. These actions are complicated and will take time. Different problems (e.g. bio-piracy, poverty, access to medication, or commodification of care) may require different approaches. However, without an idealistic and longer-term ethical perspective it will not be possible to have effective ‘governance’ of global bioethical problems.

1. Read and analyze the books of Dickinson, Robinson, Davies and Farmer. Explore the approaches they suggest to address and eliminate global bioethical problems.
2. Determine what kind of approaches would be most useful and effective in your case study.
3. Write a paper of maximum 8 pages (not including the end notes and bibliography), answering the following questions
   a. Explain how the global ethical problem(s) in your case study can be addressed( there are always various theoretical possibilities).
   b. What is the most useful and effective approach to address this problem now?
   c. Who should be involved in this approach (actors and agencies)?
   d. What will be the best ethical argument(s) to encourage these actors and agencies?
4. Forward the paper to: tenhaveh@duq.edu on Friday November 4 for Seminar #4, November 8.
5. Prepare a brief report (5 minutes) on your paper for Seminar #4.

COURSE READINGS
The following seven books are required reading for this course. They are necessary to complete the Research Projects. The first 3 books are available at the Center for Healthcare Ethics with reduced prices.
RESOURCES AND WEBSITES
The number of internet resources for global bioethics is growing. Useful sources for cases and problems are:
- www.BioEdge.org
- www.globalbioethics.org
- www.observatoriobioetica.org/categoria/bioethics-news
- www.bioethics.com
- http://www.globethics.net/
- https://www.hrw.org/

Bioethical issues are often discussed in the media. For example, national newspapers and television frequently report on ethical issues in healthcare. Some countries have specialized journal in healthcare ethics (e.g. The Indian Journal of Medical Ethics; South African Journal of Medical Ethics). A rich source also is the Huffington Post (see for instance: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/news/bioethics/). See also newspapers as The Guardian.

Some bioethics centers are especially interested in global bioethics. Their website presents information and cases from around the world. An example: The Center for Bioethics & Human Dignity in the US (https://cbhd.org/) and the Centre for Biomedical Ethics in Singapore (http://cbme.nus.edu.sg/).

It is also useful to search the websites of UNESCO and WHO:
- http://en.unesco.org/
- www.who.int
COURSE SCHEDULE

Tuesday August 23, 2016. Seminar #1
  Introduction
  August 30, September 6 and 13, Research Project #1

Tuesday September 20, 2016. Seminar #2
  Research project #1: Global Bioethics Laboratory: presentation and discussion of case study
  Introduction
  Research project #2
  September 27, October 4 and 11, Research Project #2
  Review case study of fellow student
  Submit revised case study and Project #2 by Fri. October 14.
  Submit Course Essay Thesis, 1-page outline, basic bibliography, Fri. Sept 16

Tuesday October 18, 2016. Seminar #3
  Research project #2: Global Bioethics Debate
  Introduction
  Research project #3
  October 25; Research project #3
  Submit Project 3# by Fri. November 4.

Tuesday November 8, 2016. Seminar #4
  Research project #3: Global Bioethical Solutions
  Preparation of Course Essay
  November 15 and 29, December 6; Course essay

Tuesday December 9, 2016.
  Course essay
  Submit Course Essay by Friday, December 9, 5:00 pm.

HCE HANDBOOK. The Center for Healthcare ethics has developed a Handbook of Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines to guide students in all curriculum related matters. The Handbook is available on the HCE Website (http://www.duq.edu/Documents/healthcare-ethics/_pdf/Center%20Handbook%20revised%20December%202013.pdf)

COURSE GRADE. There will be no examinations. The course grade will be assigned based on the quality of the course research essay and the three research projects. The grade will be a combination of 10% for each of the three research projects and 70% for the final essay.
No midterm grades will be assigned. End of term grades will be assigned adopting grading policy in the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts, as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>distinguished scholarly work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B+</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>normal progress towards degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C+</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>warning; student subject to departmental action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ACADEMIC INTEGRITY.** This syllabus incorporates the “Expectations of Academic Integrity.” Cheating and plagiarism cannot be tolerated. All relevant policies of the McAnulty College and Graduate School of Liberal Arts apply.

**REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS.**
Students with documented disabilities are entitled to reasonable accommodations if needed. If you need accommodations, please contact the Office of Freshman Development and Special Student Services in 309 Duquesne Union (412-396-6657) as soon as possible. Accommodations cannot always be granted retrospectively.